



Meeting Minutes - Final

Library Board

Tuesday, November 12, 2024

10:30 AM

La Retama Central Library, La Retama Room

The City of Corpus Christi promotes participation regardless of race, color, national origin, sex, age, religion, disability or political belief. Reasonable accommodation is provided upon request and in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. For assistance or to request a reasonable accommodation, contact (361) 826-3300 at least 48 hours in advance. Upon request, this information can be available in larger print and/or in electronic format.

A. Call To Order

Pat Craig called the meeting to order at 10:31 am.

B. Roll Call

Present: Pat Craig, Carrie Moore, Joan Carrillo, Alice Hawkins, Melinda De Los Santos, Carroll

Matthews, Dolores Rabon, Dora Wilburn

Present Virtually: None

Absent: Jennifer Anderson

C. Public Comment

- Jan Kettenring said that now that the election is over, the American people have made their voices heard. They have voted for conservative, family-oriented values which reflected a strong push against evil ideologies within their children's schools and libraries. She hopes the educational system, including both school and local libraries, will make better choices when it comes to the welfare of all children. She thanked members of the board for their continued heartfelt effort to help keep children safe from exposure to inappropriate reading material.

- Dana Posey shared a book at the last meeting that she found in the teen section that she felt was inappropriate. She went to Garcia library and found a book in the juvenile section titled "And They Lived" about two boys in a relationship. She read an excerpt that she felt was pornographic and grooming. She stated that it is inappropriate for anyone under the age of 18. Juveniles are kids; this is not appropriate for any kid. If you feel like you must have this in the library, at the very least please move it to the adult section. She then began to repeat something she shared at the last meeting but her time expired. Some in the audience started making noise so she could not finish her thought. Pat Craig informed the audience that this was inappropriate, and they should let the speaker finish. Jaqueline Salinas-Bazan, assistant city attorney, stated that Chairperson Craig presides

over the meeting so she can decide to allow the speaker to finish.

- Laura Garcia asked Dana Posey if she had submitted a reconsideration form. Laura then made a statement of fact that this title is in the YA section, not the children's section. Miss Posey then interjected that she was told it was the juvenile section and Laura pointed out that it is labeled YA. Miss Posey then asked what that means. Laura stated that juvenile is 12 and under, and YA is 13 and up. Miss Posey then responded back that juvenile is anyone under the age of 18. Laura responded that the library classification for that age group is YA. Miss Posey then stated that the Department of Justice doesn't agree. Laura thanked her and asked again if Miss Posey had submitted a request for reconsideration form. Dana Posey stated that she had not.

- Jazmeyne Evans said that some of the suggestions for the collection development policy revolving around the removal of language about freedom of choice in the library system concern her. She quoted some of the sections removed, such as "patrons are free to choose what they want from the selection and reject what they don't like but not to restrict the freedom of others to choose". She was also concerned that in the same document it says "parents are responsible for their own children during library programs" but you are taking away that responsibility by having them responsible for the material that their children are consuming. By completely removing materials and saying some of them are pornographic and some aren't it is completely dependent upon looking at the community or the community that is being judged for it. She thought it is concerning that the public institution is removing choice. She would like the policy to be reviewed at its normal time, not random suggestions.

- Sylvia Tryon read the duties of the library board, and it made her wonder who is qualified to serve and if they are really serving according to the qualifications. She asked if they were embracing diversity or are they ready to get rid of the only black person on the board because she does not align with the way that they want things to go. She asked them to do their job and make sure the material in the library is open to the public. She said keep diversity. Embrace it, not erase it in Corpus Christi. We need you behind every white person and every person of color to be able to serve on boards. Pat Craig made a statement of fact that this has nothing to do with skin color and asked Jaqueline Salinas-Bazan to clarify. Jaqueline Salinas-Bazan stated that the City of Corpus Christi is a home rule city, meaning that we are governed not only by the laws of the state of Texas but also by our home rule charter which is available online. She quoted the charter saying "A member of a city board, commission, or committee may file as a candidate for nomination or election to any non-city public office. Upon the election or appointment to a non-city public office, or upon the filing of the candidate for a position, under the charter, such board, commission, or committee member must forfeit his or her position". This is in our charter; these are the local rules that the citizens of Corpus Christi have voted on, and you must adhere and follow them. We also follow the laws of the state of Texas. Our legal office did contact the secretary of state's office to double check this. They stated that a winning candidate may follow that process immediately once he or she receives the certificate of election. In other words, you have the candidate and once that officer takes the oath of office and receives their certificate as an elected official. Once that happens, that triggers our charter provision that she read and that we, the city, must abide by the state's rule and our own local rule. Which is what triggered the city's response. Jaqueline

then congratulated Alice Hawkins on her election. Members of the audience asked if they could ask follow-up questions and Pat Craig said we needed to move on.

- Dr. Nancy Vera is the president of the Corpus Christi American Federation of Teachers and regional director for the League of United Latin American Citizens that encompasses Nueces County and beyond. She spoke on behalf of LULAC and American Federation of Teachers and wants everyone to know that her family has been here since the mid-1800s. In fact, her family helped build Sacred Heart Church, has Catholic school education, and is very religious. As a Latina, a woman of color, I am appalled and disappointed at the manner in which some of you are behaving. I know what the agenda is. Do I support pornography? Absolutely not. As a teacher, I have never taught pornography. I do not know of any teachers who have taught pornography. This “ghostlighting” is inaccurate. I care for this community just as much as every one of you do. We built churches here. I care for my sisters and brothers of all colors. For you to dictate what my values should be, or what my ethics should be is really none of your business. You shouldn’t tell me what I should read, or when I should read it. I am upset, you have awakened a sleeping giant. You better rest assured that LULAC in conjunction with NAACP are going to put a stop to this. Pat Craig started to give a statement of fact, but Dr. Vera interrupted her. At this point Melinda De Los Santos tried to call a point of order. Pat continued with the statement of fact that it’s documented with the Commissioner’s Court that the American Federation of Teachers gave away books containing this material to families, you can go check July 2022.

- Laura Garcia stated that she feels there is confusion because Alice Hawkins has been serving on the library board while also serving on the CCISD school board as an elected official and individuals are confused as to why her being reelected made a difference. What has changed?

- Jacqueline Salinas-Bazan offered to clear things up by asking if Alice was initially appointed to the school board. Alice replied that she ran three times and was elected. She was never appointed. Jacqueline then asked if she ran again after her tenure at the library board expired. Alice then stated that when she applied to be on the library board it was questioned and received push back then. She then stated that according to the regulations per the city’s interpretation, if she is serving as an elected officer and during the interim, she is appointed it is okay but if she runs for reelection for the same job then she is supposed to give up her seat. This is what she said the city secretary told her. Jacqueline stated that is in accordance with the city charter, which can not be changed without an election. She said they double checked with the Secretary of States office, and they confirmed this was the case. Alice then started to continue, and Pat Craig called a point of order that this has already been covered. Alice proceeded to say that City Secretary recommended the first time that Alice should not serve, and according to the rules she was wrong for doing that. According to the rules she can be appointed after having been elected but once re-elected she can’t serve. She also asked for people not to repeat hearsay on social media.

- Ryan Jones said he is a father of a 14-year-old and wanted to address pornographic material in the YA section. His family has also been here since the Texas revolution, and he feels like he has the right to speak up as a father. It is inappropriate to have pornographic material available to his 14-year-old in the section that is deemed the YA

section. He would like to see a separate section for explicit material that is identified so that parents who are okay with that can let their children read it. It is not okay to expose other peoples' children to such material. As he said last time, if his daughter wants to go through the YA section and look through different books, she should not come across that material. He stated that there is a very vocal group of adults in this community who seem to think this is okay. It is a very small percentage of the adult population that meditates on the sexual thoughts that children might be having. It is an even smaller population of the adults that think about the sexual thoughts that children might be having who are motivated to get out and say something to try to influence other peoples' children. I am actually a father, who wants to protect my children. Most adults want to protect their children, I represent a large percentage of the population, and I am asking for you to continue to represent my interest in protecting my children. I am not saying to get rid of the books, I think that would be best, but if they are going to exist, they should be in a section where my children are not exposed to those types of materials.

- Roseanne Norman felt that as a taxpayer she should not have to fund such materials. If you feel like you need to have it, go out and fundraise on your own. She thinks that whenever a parent brings a kid to the library, or whenever a kid wants to check something out on their own, let something come up on the monitor or let something come up to the person checking the book out that says this book has some pornographic materials in it, so you know before you check it out. This way, if the parent is okay with it, they check it out, if a parent is not aware of it, they can put the book back. Please, do a little bit better at protecting our kids. She then shared that there was sexual abuse in her home for years, and those scars stay with you your entire lives. Most children do not want this. One out of every four girls are sexually abused, one out of every ten boys.

- Laura stated that during the upcoming presentation, some of the public comment concerns would be addressed.

- Samuel Fryer served in the military, and as a father and grandfather he thanked Mr. Jones for being a man. He said men need to stand up for our families, for our nation, and against anything that will damage our children. He said that previous comments claiming book banning are a lie and the people who say it know it's a lie. Moving a book from a section where innocent children's minds can be corrupted to a section where if an adult wants their child to read that let them check it out and let them read it. They should not come across it haphazardly and find a book and start reading this filth that this lady just read. How is that possible that any adult would want that to be the case? And then trying to talk about someone that someone is trying to move off the library board because of a policy that is in place is completely distracting. The truth is this is about our children. Our children are being corrupted with indoctrination. If a person has a lifestyle that is against the creator of heaven and earth let them have their lifestyle, they will be judged. In order to take a child and corrupt a child's mind, what is that really doing? He then quoted the Bible saying, "It is better for a man to have a millstone tied around his neck and thrown into the depths of the sea than to cause one of these little ones to fail".

- Vickie Natale read a statement made during last month's public comment saying, "the voices in opposition to the new policy are not actual parents". She said she is a parent and a grandparent and takes umbrage with that statement because she cares for the welfare of her children and grandchildren just as much as anyone else in the room. In the

previous comment he goes on to say, 'we can't block our children from going to different sections or what books are picked up when attention is given to another child'. I say, "yes you can", you are a parent and that is what being a parent is all about. If you have two children, you learn to parent both children. If you have a teenage daughter, you tell her not to go to this section of the library, you stay in this section of the library. She brought a book called "19 Minutes" that she said has been banned by your groups at many schools across the country. The book is 455 pages and is about a school shooting. It is banned because on page 313 of 455 pages there is one word that is objected to. That word is erection. She referred back to comments made that say one word can sexualize children. She said this is an adult book in the adult section that should not be removed.

D. Approval of Minutes and Action on Absences

A motion to approve the October minutes was made by Melinda De Los Santos and seconded by Joan Carrillo. The motion passed unanimously. Alice Hawkins asked that her previous absence be excused. A motion to excuse her previous absence was made by Carrie Moore and seconded by Dolores Rabon. The motion passed unanimously.

1. [24-1872](#) October 1 Library Board Minutes

Attachments: [October 1 Library Board Minutes - Draft](#)

This Minutes was approved.

E. Friends of CCPL Liaison Report

2. [24-1873](#) Friends of CCPL Liaison Report

- The Friends of CCPL did not give an update due to Jennifer Anderson's absence.

F. Director's Report

3. [24-1874](#) Director's Report

- Renovations at Neyland Library are complete, and the restrooms reopened on October 21.
- Bond 2024 passed; this included the design for a combination Community/Senior Center Complex in combination with Dr. Clotilde P. Garcia Library. This would cost \$2,000,000.
- La Retama Central Library will be closed starting Friday, November 22 and reopen Tuesday, December 3 for interior work to be done on the floor and ceiling.
- E-Rate Category 2 Wi-Fi network equipment has been received. An IT project manager has been assigned and we will be meeting to develop an installation timeline.
- We are researching funding for E-rate category 2 hotspots. Alice Hawkins asked for

more

details. Laura stated that there would be 600 instead of 5,000 this time due to decreased budget. The previous program was paid for by a \$2,000,000 grant through the American Rescue Plan.

- Our partnership with Career Online High School started in 2019. So far, there have been 23 graduates. One graduated last month and one new student entered the program this month. We have 11 scholarships to offer, funding is provided through Friends of CCPL.
- Our annual coat drive will begin in December and the pet supply drive is underway.

G. Unfinished Business

4. [24-1656](#) Collection Development Policy Questions and Discussion

Attachments:

[REFERENCES FOR TRACKED CHANGES CCPL CDP Recommendations Recieved 3 Sep 24](#)
[3 Sep 24 CCPL CDP Recommendations WITH CITATIONS](#)
[Benchmark Cities Reconsideration Comps for 3 Sep24 Docs](#)
[2024 CCPL Collection Development Policy](#)
[Library Board-November2024 \(2\)](#)
[ALA spreadsheet](#)
[library comparison in loco parentis](#)
[Card Application 8.13.24](#)
[Youth Card Application 8.13.24](#)
[Youth Card Application TOURS 10.10.2024](#)
[Authorization Checking Out 9.5.24](#)
[Texas Administrative Code2.4](#)
[Pg. 3 Texas Administrative Code with Highlights](#)

- Collection Development Policy Questions and Discussion- Laura Garcia thanked Melinda De Los Santos for sending her the citations she requested last month. The citations on the document “References for Tracked Changes in CCPL CDP”, provided by Melinda correspond to what is being requested be removed or added to the Collection Development policy. Laura stated that last month citation #1 was discussed and her understanding was that the objection was to using DEI as a unit. Since they are not being used currently in the policy as a unit it was her understanding that the board did not object to the words, nor did they have any expectations as to what was added to the collection in relation to these words.
- Laura stated that due to time limits, she would not be discussing all the references this month and instead she asked to go to slide 13 which relates to library cards. She stated that library card policies, which are separate from the collection development policy, were discussed several months back. Copies of the different library card policies were provided to the board. The library has library card policies for minors that require the parental approval. Parents are usually in the building with their child but are not required to be at the checkout desk when the child checks out material.

- Laura mentioned that the library recently created an application to handle school visits (field trips) or outreaches. This library card application will be part of the field trip permission slip process and would be handled through the teacher, parents would sign off whether they want their child to be issued a limited use card (1 print item) or not as part of the field trip to the library.
- Based on concerns that have been expressed, a new library card designation is under consideration. The card under consideration would be a "Parent\Guardian must be present" card. This card would require the parent\guardian on the account to be at the checkout desk with the child, no exceptions. If the parent\guardian is not present, no material would be checked out. This would be an additional option. The current library library card for minors would continue to be available.
- A custom enhancement would need to be done to Koha the Library Integrated System to alert staff that the library card is designated as a Parent\Guardian must be present card; as well as to block use at the self-checkout stations. The cost of the enhancement is estimated at \$5,000 to \$10,000 and funding might need to be requested through a budget initiative, which would be part of the budget process. Once funding is secured it could take up to six months or more to implement, depending on the time the company takes to develop the enhancement.
- Laura next addressed the concern regarding material in the Young Adult section. She stated that comments have been made about 13 years old not being Young Adults. She said that in the library industry, that is the way materials are labeled. However, to address the concerns that have been expressed staff is looking at adding a Teen section 13-17 years and keeping the Young Adult section as is. She wanted to make it clear that due to limited space, at some locations, the two sections may still be in close proximity to each other. Changes would require time as several things have to be done, shifting, relabeling and so forth. Creating the Teen section would be a process that would be done over the next few months. Time is needed to shift, relabel and so forth.
- Referring to Dr. Natale's comment, Laura stated that library staff also have children, and the library does not have pornography. Melinda De Los Santos asked how we can alert parents to books that have been addressed. Laura stated that the Parent guide has websites like BookLooks and several others that parents can look at. She also said we can not monitor what sections children go to; that's up to parents.
- Sony Peronel, assistant city manager, stated that we do not know percentages of the population as addressed in public comment since public comment is a small group of people, so we talked about having a survey to hear from the community as a whole.
- Laura then addressed a previous public comment in which the individual stated that there were 400 pornography books in the children's area and to her that means the juvenile section ages 12 and under. This comment was made in June and so far, she has not received any reconsideration forms regarding those books. Pat Craig stated that she had gone back to review her notes of the June public comments and the individual had stated that there are over 400 sexually explicit books on the children's area. Laura again stated that we do not have pornography. A mainstream vendor is used to buy library books. The library does not order material from pornography vendors. Some of the material that has been questioned is available at Walmart. She went to the one on Staples and titles were on their shelves and not behind a counter.

- Laura asked for clarification from Melinda, regarding the Clearwater citation mentioned in the proposed changes to the reconsideration form. She stated that we could not find a Clearwater Public Library in Texas. Clearwater, Texas is an unincorporated area and the closest library to it is the Franklin County Library. We did find a Clearwater Public Library in Florida and their policies have the statement cited in the reconsideration changes. Franklin County did not have the statement in their policies.
- Carrie Moore thanked Laura; she stated she loved all of the things being proposed. She thinks this is all they can ask for as far as parents taking responsibility, books being in the appropriate spots, and if the parents are there with their child and the child cannot take books without the parent being there. If the parent does not know what is in the book although they have been given websites to look that book up, I think that's perfect and that's all I have cared about. Carrie stated on the estimated cost of \$5,000 to \$10,000 if we can home in on exactly what we need that money for along with wi-fi hot spots they can go and fundraise the money so that it would not come out of the city's budget.
- Laura again stated that we will continue to work with the community, but we will not censor material in the collection.
- Melinda De Los Santos stated that the public comment regarding the 400 pornography books was actually referring to the Booklooks comparison presentation provided by staff back in March. She did not think the public comment was saying we had 400 pornography books in the children's section but instead was referring to the 459 books owned by CCPL that were rated in Booklooks. Laura read from Melinda's copy of the Booklooks presentation, of the 25 adult titles reviewed in Booklooks CCPL owned 11 of those titles and all 11 titles were in the CCPL adult section as recommended by Booklooks.
- Sony thanked Alice Hawkins for serving on the board. Alice said it has been an eye-opening experience and that it is important for everyone to get involved and she will be coming back.

H. New Business for Discussion and Possible Action

5. [24-1875](#) Discussion and Possible Action to Create a Subcommittee to Work On the Annual Boards Report

Attachments: [Board Annual Report Form](#)
 [2023 Library Annual Report](#)

- Discussion and Possible Action to Create a Subcommittee to work on the Annual Boards Report- Laura presented the form given by the city for the annual report. There are only six questions. Pat Craig stated that the Annual Report is put together by the Chairperson with help and asked for volunteers. Nobody volunteered so she said she would ask everyone for input and work on it.

I. Future Agenda Items

- Melinda De Los Santos asked for what programs we provide for homeless through the library. Laura said we have a social worker who assists the homeless and assists with job applications as well. Dallas has their social worker included in their budget, ours is a

student at Texas A&M Kingsville.

J. Adjournment

Adjournment at 11:39am.