

RFP No. 4570 Health & Welfare Ins Coverage

Summary Evaluation Matrix

Sr. Buyer Marco Lozano

* Failed to submit qualified proposal

Medical / Dental		Staff Recommendation	UMR, Inc.	* Aetna	* Cigna	* TML
Proposal Evaluation	Score	Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas	Wausau, WI.	Hartford, CT.	Bloomfield CT.	Austin, TX.
		Richardson, TX				
MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS (PASS/FAIL)		Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail	Fail
Required five years in business	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---	---
AM Best rating of A- or higher	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---	---
No outstanding lawsuits during last 5 years or current litigation with the City during last 5 years	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---	---
No outstanding regulatory issues last 5 years	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---	---
References Provided for firm	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---	---
Minimum Qualification	Pass/Fail					
Local Preference						
Points	10	0	0	---	---	---
Technical Proposal						
Cost	10	10	7	---	---	---
Cost Containment	10	9	5	---	---	---
Claims Processing	10	9	8	---	---	---
Reporting	10	10	8	---	---	---
Integrated Systems / Technology Initiative	5	5	4	---	---	---
Past Performance & Communication	5	5	3	---	---	---
Subtotal Technical Proposal	50	46	35	---	---	---
Competitive Range Subtotal	60	46	35	---	---	---
Interview						
Firms' Experience (5 points)	5	4	3	---	---	---
Understanding of Project Scope (5 points)	5	4	3	---	---	---
Subtotal Interview	10	8	6	---	---	---
Pricing						
Cost information should consider the scope of work while taking into consideration the size of the City. Methodology and assumptions utilized in deriving cost should be explained.	30	30	28	---	---	---
Subtotal Price	30	30	28	---	---	---
Total	100	84	69	---	---	---

RFP No. 4570 Health & Welfare Ins Coverage

Summary Evaluation Matrix

Sr. Buyer Marco Lozano

* Failed to submit qualified proposal

Pharmacy		Staff Recommendation			
Proposal Evaluation	Score	CVS	OptumRx	* Cigna	* TML
		Woonsocket, RI.	Schaumburg IL.	Bloomfield CT.	Austin, TX.
MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS (PASS/FAIL)		Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail
Required five years in business	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---
AM Best rating of A- or higher	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---
No outstanding lawsuits during last 5 years or current litigation with the City during last 5 years	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---
No outstanding regulatory issues last 5 years	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---
References Provided for firm	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	---	---
Minimum Qualification	Pass/Fail				
Local Preference					
Points	10	0	0	---	---
Technical Proposal					
Cost	10	9	8	---	---
Cost Containment	10	6	6	---	---
Claims Processing	10	8	8	---	---
Reporting	10	8	8	---	---
Integrated Systems / Technology Initiative	5	3	3	---	---
Past Performance & Communication	5	4	3	---	---
Subtotal Technical Proposal	50	39	37	---	---
Competitive Range Subtotal	60	39	37	---	---
Interview					
Firms' Experience (5 points)	5	4	3	---	---
Understanding of Project Scope (5 points)	5	4	3	---	---
Subtotal Interview	10	8	7	---	---
Pricing					
Cost information should consider the scope of work while taking into consideration the size of the City. Methodology and assumptions utilized in deriving cost should be explained.	30	30	28	---	---
Subtotal Price	30	30	28	---	---
Total	100	76	72	---	---

RFP No. 4564 Life and Disability Insurance Coverage

Summary Evaluation Matrix

Sr. Buyer Marco Lozano

		Staff Recommendation					
Proposal Evaluation	Score	Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas	Continental American Insurance, Aflac	Symetra Life Insurance Company	Voya Financial	OCHS-Madison National Life Insurance Company	Hartford Life & Accident Insurance Company
		Richardson, TX	Columbia, SC	Bellevue, WA	Houston, TX	Madison, WI	Hartford, CT
MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS (PASS/FAIL)		Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Required five years in business	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
AM Best rating of A- or higher	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
No outstanding lawsuits during last 5 years or current litigation with the City during last 5 years	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
No outstanding regulatory issues last 5 years	Pass/Fail	✓	✓	✓	✓	Fail	✓
References Provided for firm	Pass/Fail	✓	Fail	✓	✓	Fail	✓
Minimum Qualification	Pass/Fail						
Technical Proposal							
Understanding of the Program	14	13	12	11	12	11	10
Methodology used for the Program	14	13	13	11	12	11	10
Management Plan for the Program	14	13	12	11	11	11	10
References, Experience and Qualifications	8	7	5	7	7	5	6
Subtotal Technical Proposal	50	46	42	40	41	37	36
Interview							
Firms' Experience (5 points)	5	5	4	4	4	- - -	- - -
Understanding of Project Scope (5 points)	5	4	4	4	4	- - -	- - -
Subtotal Interview	10	8	8	8	8	0	0
Pricing							
Cost information should consider the scope of work while taking into consideration the size of the City. Methodology and assumptions utilized in deriving cost should be explained.	40	37	40	34	21	0	0
Subtotal Price	40	37	40	34	21	0	0
Total	100	92	90	82	70	37	36