



3755 S. Capital of Texas Highway  
Suite 325  
Austin, TX 78704  
TEL 512.485.0009  
FAX 512.485.0010  
www.GarverUSA.com

September 11, 2017

City of Corpus Christi  
Engineering Services  
Attn: Mr. Jeff Edmonds  
1201 Leopard Street  
Corpus Christi, Texas 78401

Re: Corpus Christi International Airport  
East GA and Terminal Apron Reconstruction – Project No. E15223 and E15234  
Recommendation of Award

Dear Mr. Edmonds:

Bids were received for the "East GA and Terminal Apron Reconstruction" project at City Hall at 2:00 p.m. (local time) on August 9, 2017. The bids have been checked for accuracy and for compliance with the contract documents. A tabulation of the bids received is enclosed with this letter.

A total of 3 bids were received on the project. The bid by Mitchell Enterprises, Ltd. was rejected (see attached Evaluation of Bids letter dated August 23, 2017, and Rejection of Bid letter dated September 7, 2017). Therefore, of the remaining bids, SpawGlass Civil Construction, Inc. submitted the low bid for the project in the amount of \$3,369,687.21 for the base bid and three additive alternates. The Engineer's Opinion of Probable Cost was \$3,855,000 for the base bid and three additive alternates.

We believe that the bid submitted by SpawGlass Civil Construction, Inc. represents a good value for the Corpus Christi International Airport. Contingent upon approval of Federal Aviation Administration funding for the project, we recommend that the construction contract for the "East GA and Terminal Apron Reconstruction" be awarded to SpawGlass Civil Construction, Inc.

Please call me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

GARVER, LLC

Josh Crawford, P.E.  
Project Manager

Attachments: Bid Tabulation  
Evaluation of Bids letter, dated August 23, 2017  
Rejection of Bid letter, dated September 7, 2017

# TABULATION OF BIDS

## DEPARTMENT OF ENGINEERING SERVICES - CITY OF CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS

BID DATE: August 9, 2017, 2:00 PM (Local Time)  
ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE: BASE BID: \$ 3,855,000.00

TABULATED BY: Josh Crawford, P.E.  
TIME OF COMPLETION: Base Bid: 365 Calendar Days

EAST 0A AND TERMINAL APRON RECONSTRUCTION PROJECT NO. E15223 & E15234		ENGINEERS ESTIMATE		MITCHELL ENTERPRISES, LTD 700 N. CROCKETT SHERMAN, TEXAS 75090		SPAWGLASS CIVIL CONSTRUCTION, INC. 13800 WEST ROAD HOUSTON, TEXAS 77041		BAY LTD 1414 VALERO WAY CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78409	
ITEM	QTY.	UNIT	DESCRIPTION	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
BASE BID									
PART A - BASE BID - GENERAL									
A1	1	L.S.	01 29 01 MOBILIZATION	\$250,000.00	\$250,000.00	\$359,812.00	\$359,812.00	\$334,310.00	\$334,310.00
A2	1	L.S.	01 29 01 BONDS AND INSURANCE	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$125,664.00	\$125,664.00	\$74,521.00	\$74,521.00
A3	1	L.S.	01 29 01 OWNER'S PROTECTIVE INSURANCE	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$18,480.00	\$18,480.00	\$3,735.00	\$3,735.00
SUBTOTAL PART A - BASE BID - GENERAL (Items A1 thru A3)					\$360,000.00		\$503,956.00		\$412,566.00

PART B - BASE BID - TERMINAL APRON									
B1	1	L.S.	SS-120-3.1 SITE PREPARATION	\$250,410.00	\$250,410.00	\$139,782.00	\$139,782.00	\$317,801.61	\$317,801.61
B2	1	L.S.	SS-130-4.1 TRENCH AND EXCAVATION SAFETY SYSTEMS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$1,404.00	\$1,404.00	\$6,437.85	\$6,437.85
B3	453	L.F.	SS-220-5.1 DITCH GRADING	\$15.00	\$6,795.00	\$46.00	\$20,838.00	\$31.82	\$14,414.46
B4	1	L.S.	SS-300-5.1 LOCKOUT/TAGOUT AND CONSTANT CURRENT REGULATOR CALIBRATION PROCEDURES	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$3,046.47	\$3,046.47
B5	7	EACH	SS-301-5.1 EXISTING BASE MOUNTED EDGE LIGHT, REMOVED	\$300.00	\$2,100.00	\$404.00	\$2,828.00	\$131.99	\$923.93
B6	250	L.F.	SS-301-5.2 EXISTING CONCRETE ENCASED, ELECTRICAL CONDUIT, 1-WAY 2" C, REMOVED	\$20.00	\$5,000.00	\$20.00	\$5,000.00	\$13.52	\$3,380.00
B7	5	EACH	SS-310-5.1 L 1861(L) BASE MOUNTED TAXIWAY EDGE LIGHT, INSTALLED	\$2,500.00	\$12,500.00	\$1,478.00	\$7,390.00	\$5,399.30	\$26,997.50
B8	1	L.S.	SS-310-5.2 TEMPORARY AIRFIELD LIGHTING	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$6,160.00	\$6,160.00	\$2,804.63	\$2,804.63
B9	7783	S.Y.	P-101-5.1 PAVEMENT REMOVAL, ASPHALT (5")	\$10.00	\$77,830.00	\$11.00	\$85,613.00	\$10.81	\$84,134.23
B10	4380	C.Y.	P-152-4.1 UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION	\$15.00	\$65,700.00	\$25.00	\$109,500.00	\$21.47	\$94,038.60
B11	1000	C.Y.	P-152-4.2 UNSUITABLE EXCAVATION	\$30.00	\$30,000.00	\$30.00	\$30,000.00	\$21.83	\$21,630.00
B12	1	L.S.	P-156-5.1 TEMPORARY EROSION CONTROL	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$10,395.00	\$10,395.00	\$28,801.43	\$28,801.43
B13	7856	S.Y.	P-304-8.1 CEMENT TREATED BASE COURSE (10")	\$35.00	\$274,960.00	\$44.00	\$345,664.00	\$41.70	\$327,595.20
B14	7783	S.Y.	P-501-8.1 PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE PAVEMENT (15")	\$210.00	\$1,654,430.00	\$119.00	\$926,177.00	\$156.48	\$1,217,883.84
B15	922	S.F.	P-620-5.1 1a PAVEMENT MARKINGS (YELLOW) WITH REFLECTIVE MEDIA	\$3.00	\$2,766.00	\$3.00	\$2,766.00	\$3.67	\$3,383.74
B16	1756	S.F.	P-620-5.1 1b PAVEMENT MARKINGS (BLACK) WITHOUT REFLECTIVE MEDIA	\$3.00	\$5,268.00	\$2.00	\$3,512.00	\$2.94	\$5,162.64

EAST GA AND TERMINAL APRON RECONSTRUCTION PROJECT NO. E15223 & E15234				ENGINEERS ESTIMATE		MITCHELL ENTERPRISES, LTD 700 N. CROCKETT SHERMAN, TEXAS 75090		SPAWGLASS CIVIL CONSTRUCTION INC. 13800 WEST ROAD HOUSTON, TEXAS 77041		BAY LTD 1414 VALERO WAY CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78409	
B17	801	S.F.	P-620-5.2 PAVEMENT MARKING REMOVAL	\$11.00	\$8,811.00	\$3.00	\$2,403.00	\$2.69	\$2,154.69	\$3.40	\$2,723.40
B18	0.4	ACRE	T-901-5.1 SEEDING	\$7,000.00	\$2,800.00	\$9,000.00	\$3,600.00	\$28,393.18	\$11,357.27	\$30,000.00	\$12,000.00
B19	367	S.Y.	T-904-5.1 SODDING	\$15.00	\$5,505.00	\$13.00	\$4,771.00	\$24.03	\$8,819.01	\$26.00	\$9,542.00
B20	875	L.F.	L-108-5.1 NO. 8 AWG. 5 KV, L 824, TYPE C CABLE, INSTALLED IN TRENCH, DUCT BANK OR CONDUIT	\$2.00	\$1,750.00	\$4.00	\$3,500.00	\$1.82	\$1,592.50	\$1.95	\$1,706.25
B21	375	L.F.	L-108-5.2 NO. 6 AWG. SOLID, BARE COUNTERPOISE WIRE, INSTALLED IN TRENCH, ABOVE THE DUCT BANK OR CONDUIT, INCLUDING GROUND RODS AND GROUND CONNECTORS	\$2.00	\$750.00	\$7.00	\$2,625.00	\$2.33	\$873.75	\$1.95	\$731.25
B22	375	L.F.	L-110-5.1 NON-ENCASED, ELECTRICAL CONDUIT, 1 WAY 2" C	\$15.00	\$5,625.00	\$8.00	\$3,000.00	\$7.52	\$2,820.00	\$15.75	\$5,906.25
SUBTOTAL PART B - BASE BID - TERMINAL APRON (Items B1 thru B22)					\$2,443,000.00		\$1,720,928.00		\$2,164,455.15		\$2,637,426.35

Part C - BASE BID - EAST GA APRON											
C1	1	L.S.	SS-120-3.1 SITE PREPARATION	\$250,385.00	\$250,385.00	\$14,439.00	\$14,439.00	\$102,417.07	\$102,417.07	\$6,200.00	\$6,200.00
C2	1	L.S.	SS-130-4.1 TRENCH AND EXCAVATION SAFETY SYSTEMS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$862.00	\$862.00	\$6,437.85	\$6,437.85	\$1,300.00	\$1,300.00
C3	2635	S.Y.	P-101-5.2 PAVEMENT REMOVAL ASPHALT (11")	\$10.00	\$26,350.00	\$18.00	\$47,430.00	\$10.06	\$26,508.10	\$8.10	\$21,343.50
C4	33	S.Y.	P-101-5.3 PAVEMENT REMOVAL PCC (11")	\$10.00	\$330.00	\$60.00	\$1,980.00	\$157.45	\$5,195.85	\$130.00	\$4,290.00
C5	1027	C.Y.	P-152-4.1 UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION	\$15.00	\$15,405.00	\$25.00	\$25,675.00	\$23.30	\$23,929.10	\$16.00	\$16,432.00
C6	1000	C.Y.	P-152-4.2 UNSUITABLE EXCAVATION	\$30.00	\$30,000.00	\$30.00	\$30,000.00	\$22.69	\$22,690.00	\$47.00	\$47,000.00
C7	2635	S.Y.	P-155-8.1 UME-TREATED SUBGRADE (12")	\$6.00	\$15,810.00	\$14.00	\$36,890.00	\$11.20	\$29,512.00	\$7.50	\$19,762.50
C8	87	TON	P-155-8.2 UME	\$250.00	\$21,750.00	\$261.00	\$22,707.00	\$242.46	\$21,094.02	\$280.00	\$24,360.00
C9	1	L.S.	P-156-5.1 TEMPORARY EROSION CONTROL	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$3,836.00	\$3,836.00	\$9,894.43	\$9,894.43	\$26,200.00	\$26,200.00
C10	2635	S.Y.	P-304-8.1 CEMENT-TREATED BASE COURSE (10")	\$35.00	\$92,225.00	\$44.00	\$115,940.00	\$43.55	\$114,754.25	\$35.00	\$92,225.00
C11	2668	S.Y.	P-501-8.1 PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE PAVEMENT (15")	\$210.00	\$560,280.00	\$119.00	\$317,492.00	\$160.11	\$427,173.48	\$230.00	\$613,640.00
C12	281	S.F.	P-670-5.1 1a PAVEMENT MARKINGS (YELLOW) WITH REFLECTIVE MEDIA	\$3.00	\$843.00	\$3.00	\$843.00	\$3.67	\$1,031.27	\$3.40	\$955.40
C13	518	S.F.	P-670-5.1 1b PAVEMENT MARKINGS (BLACK) WITHOUT REFLECTIVE MEDIA	\$3.00	\$1,554.00	\$2.00	\$1,036.00	\$2.94	\$1,522.92	\$3.40	\$1,761.20
C14	188	S.F.	P-670-5.2 PAVEMENT MARKING REMOVAL	\$11.00	\$2,068.00	\$3.00	\$564.00	\$2.69	\$505.72	\$3.40	\$639.20
SUBTOTAL PART C - BASE BID - EAST GA APRON (C1 thru C14)					\$1,052,000.00		\$619,894.00		\$792,666.06		\$876,108.80
ADDITIVE ALTERNATE I											
Part D - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE I - EAST GA APRON											
D1	1	EACH	SS-301-5.1 EXISTING BASE MOUNTED EDGE LIGHT, REMOVED	\$300.00	\$300.00	\$404.00	\$404.00	\$132.00	\$132.00	\$2,700.00	\$2,700.00

EAST GA AND TERMINAL APRON RECONSTRUCTION PROJECT NO. E15223 & E15234										ENGINEERS ESTIMATE		MITCHELL ENTERPRISES, LTD 700 N. CROCKETT SHERMAN, TEXAS 75090		SPAWGLASS CIVIL CONSTRUCTION, INC. 13800 WEST ROAD HOUSTON, TEXAS 77041		BAY LTD 1414 VALERO WAY CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78409	
D2	2	EACH	55-310-5.1 L-861(U) BASE MOUNTED TAXIWAY EDGE LIGHT, INSTALLED	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$1,478.00	\$2,956.00	\$1,117.72	\$2,235.44	\$1,700.00	\$3,400.00						
D3	1615	S.Y.	P-101-5.2 PAVEMENT REMOVAL ASPHALT (11")	\$10.00	\$16,150.00	\$18.00	\$29,070.00	\$13.91	\$22,464.65	\$8.70	\$14,050.50						
D4	647	C.Y.	P-152-4.1 UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION	\$15.00	\$9,705.00	\$25.00	\$16,175.00	\$19.70	\$12,804.13	\$12.00	\$7,764.00						
D5	1639	S.Y.	P-155-B.1 LIME-TREATED SUBGRADE (12")	\$6.00	\$9,834.00	\$14.00	\$22,946.00	\$17.23	\$28,239.97	\$7.50	\$12,282.50						
D6	54	TON	P-155-B.2 LIME	\$250.00	\$13,500.00	\$261.00	\$14,094.00	\$242.46	\$13,092.84	\$211.00	\$11,394.00						
D7	1627	S.Y.	P-304-B.1 CEMENT-TREATED BASE COURSE (10")	\$35.00	\$56,945.00	\$44.00	\$71,588.00	\$40.10	\$65,242.70	\$31.00	\$50,437.00						
D8	1615	S.Y.	P-501-B.1 PORTLAND-CEMENT CONCRETE PAVEMENT (15")	\$210.00	\$339,150.00	\$119.00	\$192,185.00	\$167.67	\$270,787.05	\$210.00	\$339,150.00						
D9	0.1	ACRE	T-901-5.1 SEEDING	\$7,000.00	\$700.00	\$9,000.00	\$900.00	\$39,504.90	\$3,950.49	\$47,000.00	\$4,700.00						
D10	56	S.Y.	T-904-5.1 SODDING	\$15.00	\$840.00	\$13.00	\$728.00	\$24.03	\$1,345.68	\$20.00	\$1,120.00						
D11	400	L.F.	L-108-5.1 NO. 8 AWG, 5 HV, L-824, TYPE C CABLE, INSTALLED IN TRENCH, DUCT BANK OR CONDUIT	\$2.00	\$800.00	\$4.00	\$1,600.00	\$2.07	\$828.00	\$1.55	\$620.00						
D12	100	L.F.	L-108-5.2 NO. 6 AWG, SOLID, BARE COUNTERPOISE WIRE, INSTALLED IN TRENCH, ABOVE THE DUCT BANK OR CONDUIT, INCLUDING GROUND RODS AND GROUND CONNECTORS	\$2.00	\$200.00	\$4.00	\$400.00	\$5.09	\$509.00	\$1.55	\$155.00						
D13	100	L.F.	L-110-5.1 NON-ENCASED, ELECTRICAL CONDUIT, 1-WAY 2" C	\$15.00	\$1,500.00	\$4.00	\$400.00	\$9.66	\$966.00	\$12.50	\$1,250.00						
SUBTOTAL PART D - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE I - EAST GA APRON (D1 thru D13)					\$454,624.00		\$353,446.00		\$422,597.95		\$448,533.00						
ADDITIVE ALTERNATE II																	
Part E - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE II - EAST GA APRON																	
E1	807	S.Y.	P-101-5.2 PAVEMENT REMOVAL ASPHALT (11")	\$10.00	\$8,070.00	\$18.00	\$14,526.00	\$10.06	\$8,118.42	\$12.25	\$9,885.75						
E2	314	C.Y.	P-152-4.1 UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION	\$15.00	\$4,710.00	\$25.00	\$7,850.00	\$37.47	\$11,765.58	\$16.75	\$5,259.50						
E3	819	S.Y.	P-155-B.1 LIME-TREATED SUBGRADE (12")	\$6.00	\$4,914.00	\$14.00	\$11,466.00	\$17.53	\$14,357.07	\$11.67	\$9,557.73						
E4	27	TON	P-155-B.2 LIME	\$250.00	\$6,750.00	\$261.00	\$7,047.00	\$242.48	\$6,546.42	\$220.00	\$5,940.00						
E5	813	S.Y.	P-304-B.1 CEMENT-TREATED BASE COURSE (10")	\$35.00	\$28,455.00	\$44.00	\$35,772.00	\$43.28	\$35,186.64	\$28.00	\$22,764.00						
E6	807	S.Y.	P-501-B.1 PORTLAND-CEMENT CONCRETE PAVEMENT (15")	\$210.00	\$169,470.00	\$119.00	\$96,033.00	\$183.49	\$148,076.43	\$230.00	\$185,610.00						
E7	28	S.Y.	T-904-5.1 SODDING	\$15.00	\$420.00	\$13.00	\$364.00	\$24.01	\$672.28	\$29.00	\$812.00						
SUBTOTAL PART E - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE II - EAST GA APRON (E1 thru E7)					\$222,789.00		\$173,058.00		\$224,722.84		\$239,828.95						
ADDITIVE ALTERNATE III																	
Part F - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE III - EAST GA APRON																	
F1	807	S.Y.	P-101-5.2 PAVEMENT REMOVAL ASPHALT (11")	\$10.00	\$8,070.00	\$18.00	\$14,526.00	\$10.06	\$8,118.42	\$12.25	\$9,885.75						
F2	314	C.Y.	P-152-4.1 UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION	\$15.00	\$4,710.00	\$25.00	\$7,850.00	\$37.47	\$11,765.58	\$16.75	\$5,259.50						
F3	819	S.Y.	P-155-B.1 LIME-TREATED SUBGRADE (12")	\$6.00	\$4,914.00	\$14.00	\$11,466.00	\$17.53	\$14,357.07	\$11.67	\$9,557.73						

EAST GA AND TERMINAL APRON RECONSTRUCTION PROJECT NO. E15223 & E15234				ENGINEERS ESTIMATE		MITCHELL ENTERPRISES, LTD 700 N. CROCKETT SHERMAN, TEXAS 75090		SPAUGLASS CIVIL CONSTRUCTION, INC. 13800 WEST ROAD HOUSTON, TEXAS 77041		BAY LTD 1414 VALERO WAY CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78409	
F4	27	TON	P-155-8.2 LIME	\$250.00	\$6,750.00	\$281.00	\$7,047.00	\$242.46	\$6,546.42	\$220.00	\$5,940.00
F5	813	S.Y.	P-304-8.1 CEMENT-TREATED BASE COURSE (10")	\$35.00	\$28,455.00	\$44.00	\$35,772.00	\$43.28	\$35,106.64	\$28.00	\$22,764.00
F6	807	S.Y.	P-501-8.1 PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE PAVEMENT (15")	\$210.00	\$169,470.00	\$119.00	\$98,033.00	\$183.47	\$148,060.29	\$220.00	\$177,540.00
F7	28	S.Y.	T-904.5.1 SODDING	\$15.00	\$420.00	\$13.00	\$364.00	\$24.01	\$672.28	\$29.00	\$812.00
SUBTOTAL PART F - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE III - EAST GA APRON (F1 thru F7)					\$222,789.00		\$173,058.00		\$224,706.70		\$231,758.98

BASE BID SUMMARY											
TOTAL BASE BID - PART A					\$360,000.00		\$503,956.00		\$412,566.00		\$182,500.00
TOTAL BASE BID - PART B					\$2,443,000.00		\$1,720,928.00		\$2,164,455.15		\$2,637,428.35
TOTAL BASE BID - PART C					\$1,052,000.00		\$619,694.00		\$792,666.06		\$876,108.80
GRAND TOTAL BASE BID					\$3,855,000.00		\$2,844,578.00		\$3,369,687.21		\$3,696,035.15

ADDITIVE ALTERNATE SUMMARY											
TOTAL ADDITIVE ALTERNATE I - (PART D)					\$454,624.00		\$353,446.00		\$472,597.95		\$448,533.00
TOTAL ADDITIVE ALTERNATE II - (PART E)					\$222,789.00		\$173,058.00		\$224,722.84		\$239,828.98
TOTAL ADDITIVE ALTERNATE III - (PART F)					\$222,789.00		\$173,058.00		\$224,706.70		\$231,758.98

Designates Corrected Total Price - Error in Extensions



## ENGINEERING SERVICES

PO Box 9277  
Corpus Christi  
Texas 78469-9277

1201 Leopard Street  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Corpus Christi  
Texas 78401

Phone 361-826-3500  
Fax 361-826-3501  
www.cctexas.com

*Construction Inspection*  
4917 Holly Rd., Bldg 5  
Corpus Christi  
Texas 78411  
Phone 361-826-3555  
Fax 361-826-3520

September 7, 2017

Mitchell Enterprises, Ltd.  
P.O. Box 3109  
Sherman, Texas 75091

Re: Rejection of Bid for Projects # E15223 and E15234  
Corpus Christi International Airport  
East GA and Terminal Apron Reconstruction Projects

Dear Bidder:

The City of Corpus Christi (the "City") received your bid for Projects # E15223 and E15234, Corpus Christi International Airport, East GA and Terminal Apron Reconstruction Projects. The City hereby rejects your bid for the following reason(s) listed in the bid documents.

**24.01 The following will be cause to reject a Bid:**

- ☐ BID ACKNOWLEDGEMENT FORM/Bid Submittal is not signed.
- ☐ No Bid Security, with Power of Attorney, submitted as required.
- ☐ Evidence of collusion among Bidders.
- ☐ Sworn testimony or discovery in pending litigation with City which discloses misconduct or willful refusal by Bidder to comply with subject contract or Instructions of City.
- ☐ Failure to attend the mandatory Pre-Bid Conference.
- ☐ Bidder has been debarred or suspended by Owner.
- ☐ Bidder or principals are currently debarred or suspended by Federal, State or City governmental agencies.

**24.02 The following may be cause to reject a Bid or to deem a Bid non-responsive or irregular:**

- ☐ Poor performance under a previous City contract.
- ☐ Failure to achieve reasonable progress on an existing City contract.
- ☐ Default on previous contracts.
- ☐ Evidence of failure to pay Subcontractors, Suppliers or employees in accordance with Contract requirements.
- ☒ Bid contains omissions, alterations of form, additions, qualifications or conditions not called for by City, or is incomplete.
- ☐ Failure to acknowledge receipt of Addenda.
- ☐ Evidence of Bidder's lack of capacity to perform the Work.

- ☐ Failure to submit STATEMENT OF EXPERIENCE within the allotted time(s).
- ☐ Failure to timely execute Contract after award.
- ☐ Previous environmental violations resulting in fines or citations by a governmental entity (i.e. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Texas Commission on Environmental Quality, etc.).
- ☐ Bidder's Safety Experience.
- ☒ Failure of Bidder to demonstrate, through submission of the Statement of Experience, the experience required as specified in Section 00 45 16 STATEMENT OF EXPERIENCE.
- ☐ Evidence of Bidder's lack of sufficient resources, workforce, equipment or supervision.
- ☐ Unbalanced Unit Price Bid.
- ☐ Evidence of Bidder's lack of capacity to perform the Work.

If you would like to have your bid documents returned, please contact us to schedule a pick up.  
Thank you for your interest in this project.

Sincerely,



Dana M. Espinal, MBA  
Senior Project Manager  
Engineering Services

Reviewed by:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Engineer of Record



3755 S. Capital of Texas Highway  
Suite 325  
Austin, TX 78704  
TEL 512.485.0009  
FAX 512.485.0010  
www.GarverUSA.com

August 23, 2017

City of Corpus Christi  
Engineering Services  
Attn: Mr. Jeff Edmonds  
1201 Leopard Street  
Corpus Christi, Texas 78401

Re: Corpus Christi International Airport  
East GA and Terminal Apron Reconstruction – Project No. E15223 and E15234  
Evaluation of Bids

Dear Mr. Edmonds:

Bids were received for the above referenced project at City Hall at 2:00 p.m. (local time) on August 9, 2017. The bids have been evaluated for accuracy and for compliance with the contract documents. A total of 3 bids were received on the project with Mitchell Enterprises, Ltd as the apparent low bidder. The tabulation of the bids received is also enclosed with this letter.

Per Article 7 of Section 00 30 00 Bid Acknowledgement Form and Article 1 of Section 00 45 16 Statement of Experience, each bidder was required to provide the following for evaluation.

1. Bid Security
2. Section 00 30 00 Bid Acknowledgement Form and documentation of signatory authority
3. Section 00 30 01 Bid Form
4. Section 00 30 02 Compliance to State Law on Nonresident Bidders
5. Section 00 30 05 Disclosure of Interest
6. Section 00 30 06 Non-Collusion Certification
7. Section 00 72 03 Minority/MBE/DBE Participation Policy
8. Section 00 45 16 Statement of Experience

Please consider the following as a summary of submittals we found to have information omitted, or were potential discrepancies in each bidder's submittal.

**Mitchell Enterprises, Ltd.**

- Section 00 30 00 Bid Acknowledgment Form:
  - Form was signed and attested but bidder did not provide separate documentation for signatory authority, as required per Article 10 of this Section.
- Section 00 72 03 Minority/MBE/DBE Participation Policy:
  - The DBE subcontractor, AJ Airfield Lighting and Signs, was committed to \$390,000 of the proposed total amount (base bid and additive alternates) for electrical and civil work associated with lighting/signs and cement treated base/base courses. AJ Airfield Lighting and Signs is DBE certified as an electrical contractor (NAICS 238210) but not for civil work associated with cement treated base course/base course.
  - If DBE goals are not met, the form included in this Section titled, Schedule of DBE



Unavailability, is required to be signed by bidder. This form was not provided.

- The bidder's total price for lighting/signs and cement treated base/base course is equivalent to 18.2% of the total proposed amount (base bid plus additive alternates) proposed. The percentage committed to the DBE subcontractor, AJ Airfield Lighting and Signs, per the DBE participation forms provided by the bidder does not match percentage proposed in bidder's Section 00 45 16 Statement of Qualifications for description of work to subcontract.
- Section 00 45 16 Statement of Experience:
  - As required in Table 1 of this Section, in response to the question regarding bidder's average revenue for this current year, the bidder stated \$12,000,000. The bidder's proposed total bid of \$3,544,140 is approximately 30% of the bidder's estimated revenue.
  - The following questions were required to be addressed with a yes/no response, per Table 1 of this Section.
    - Question 1 regarding bidder's history of being disqualified from a bid within the past 10 years was not answered yes/no, but instead answered as not applicable. Due to the response from this question we cannot determine if this event has occurred.
    - Question 2 regarding bidder being released from bid or proposal in the past 10 years was not answered yes/no, but instead answered as not applicable. Bidder omitted disclosing a request on July 15, 2016 for release from previous bid with City of Corpus Christi for project E15221.
    - Question 3 regarding history of bidder being in default on project or failure to complete work was not answered yes/no, but instead answered as not applicable. Due to the response from this question we cannot determine if this event has occurred.
    - Question 4 regarding bidder being involved in claims or litigation with project owners within the past 10 years (and if answer is yes, provide details in a separate attachment) was answered yes. Bidder acknowledged current claim with the City of Wichita Falls but details in separate attachment were not provided. Follow up with project owner indicated this is not a claim but currently in litigation.
    - Question 5 regarding history of liens or claims for outstanding invoices for project begun within the preceding three years was not answered yes/no, but instead answered as not applicable. Due to the response from this question we cannot determine if this event has occurred.
  - As required per Table 2 of this Section, the names of entities performing subcontracting work was not provided. Estimated percentage of contract price for base courses and electrical work to be subcontracted did not match that provided for DBE subcontractor committed to 11.0% in Section 00 72 03.
  - The following was determined from a follow up discussion with references provided by the bidder for the project experience, as required per Table 3 of this Section.
    - Reference follow up on the Taxiway and Apron Improvements project at Perryton-Ochiltree Airport reported contract time was 270 calendar days with 107 days for weather and time suspension for a total of 377 contract days; bidder stated contract days was 385 days. Reference stated the project was

- 351 days late. Number of days late was omitted by bidder.
- Reference follow up on the Hangar and Apron Improvements project at South Texas International Airport confirmed bidder's statement regarding issues with site work contractor failing to meet grades, but also indicated issues obtaining TCEQ approval for fuel storage tank removal which resulted in the original completion date of January 26, 2017 passed and number of days late are still accruing. Number of days late was reported by bidder as 64.
- Reference follow up on the Phase II Construction project at Waco Regional Airport confirmed contract was 92 days late. Number of days late was omitted by bidder.
- Reference follow up on the Taxiway Rehabilitation at Wichita Falls confirmed project was deemed substantially complete on July 26, 2017 and is a minimum 409 days late as reported by bidder. Bidder stated the claim/issue/litigation is currently in negotiation, however, reference confirmed this issue is in litigation.

**SpawGlass Civil Construction, Inc.**

- Bid Security:
  - Bidder provided a correct City project name but incorrect City project number.

**Bay, Ltd.**

- Section 00 72 03 Minority/MBE/DBE Participation Policy:
  - The minimum goal of 8.87% was not met and provided one email to one potential firm as good faith effort.
- Section 00 45 16 Statement of Experience:
  - Resumes for key personnel were not provided as required by Table 2 of this Section.
  - Backup documentation for the bidder's Experience Modification Ratios, as required by Table 1 of this Section, was omitted.

Due to the failure to provide information and the potential discrepancies noted above for the apparent low bidder, we are unable to provide a recommendation of award. Additionally, we recommend the City consult with the FAA as it considers awarding the contract.

Sincerely,

GARVER, LLC



Josh Crawford, P.E.  
Project Manager

Attachments: Tabulation of Bids

Cc: Fred Segundo, Mario Tapia, Victor Gonzalez, Frank McIlwain, Dana Espinal, Sylvia Arriaga, Jerry Shoemaker, Marcelino Sanchez