



October 24, 2017

J.H. Edmonds, P.E.
Director of Engineering Services
City of Corpus Christi
P.O. Box 9277
Corpus Christi, TX 78469-9277

Re: Oso Water Reclamation Plant Headworks and Lift Station
Project No. E12206
Construction Contract Award Recommendation

Dear Mr. Edmonds:

On Wednesday, August 16, 2017, bids were received and opened at 2:00 pm by City staff for the Oso Water Reclamation Plant Headworks and Lift Station project, E12206. The project consists of new lift station, headworks, and odor control facilities to replace the existing deteriorated facilities at the Oso Water Reclamation Plant. The existing plant will remain in service for the duration of the project and must continue to effectively process wastewater to ensure that all discharges are compliant with the City's discharge permit.

There were four (4) bidders on this project and all were below the Engineer's Opinion of Probable Construction Cost (OPCC). Table 1 provides a summary of the bid tabulation results of the four bidders, along with the Engineer's OPCC.

Table 1 – Summary of Bid Tabulation

Description	COBRA/CYMI JV	CSA Construction, Inc.	Kiewit Infrastructure South Co.	Pepper Lawson Waterworks, LLC	Engineer's Opinion of Probable Construction Cost
Base Bid	\$ 21,305,990.00	\$ 22,325,000.00	\$ 24,222,130.00	\$ 24,999,180.00	\$ 26,776,000.00
Additive Alternate No. 1	\$ 585,000.00	\$ 540,540.00	\$ 480,870.00	\$ 521,820.00	\$ 750,000.00
Base Bid + Add. Alt. 1	\$ 21,890,990.00	\$ 22,865,540.00	\$ 24,703,000.00	\$ 25,521,000.00	\$ 27,526,000.00

The apparent three low bidders were required to submit their statement of experience (SOE) to demonstrate their experience and qualifications. Due to the complexity and critical nature of this project, the City and LNV/Jacobs established minimum experience requirements which must be achieved before a Contractor is considered a responsive bidder. The minimum experience requirements and how they are to be taken into consideration are specified in *Section 00 45 16 Statement of Experience* of the contract documents. The Contractors must demonstrate that they have successfully completed projects of comparable type, complexity and magnitude by providing a list of similar projects and



references for each project. In preparing an SOE, it is understood that each Contractor will consider their entire body of work and choose similar projects that best demonstrate their capabilities and past project performance.

The following two tables summarize the evaluation of the COBRA/CYMI JV SOE.

COBRA/CYMI JV SOE
<u>ITEMS DEMONSTRATING EXPERIENCE</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Resume for Project Manager and Quality Control Manager demonstrates sufficient experience in similar public-sector water and wastewater projects.• One (1) of the six (6) listed projects qualifies as a similar project completed by the bidder's organization.• COBRA and CYMI demonstrated better than average Construction Site Safety Experience Modification Ratios (EMR) for 2016 (one of the 3 years requested). For 2014 and 2015, the SOE referenced better than average EMR's for Applied Control Technology, a subsidiary of CYMI.
<u>ITEMS NOT DEMONSTRATING EXPERIENCE</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Resumes for key staff such as the Project Superintendent, Electrical General Superintendent, and Safety Director/Manger do not demonstrate experience in public-sector water and wastewater treatment projects. Resumes for alternates were not provided.• Four (4) of the six (6) listed projects have not been completed and are still under construction. These projects cannot be used to demonstrate the Contractor's ability to successfully complete projects.• One (1) of the listed projects is considered a non-similar project consisting of an industrial sector, chemical facility design-build (D/B) project.• One (1) of the listed projects is considered only marginally similar as it included a large amount of collection system micro-tunneling which is unrelated to this work.• One (1) of the listed projects is considered only marginally similar as it consisted of large diameter water distribution lines which is not included in this work.• COBRA did not provide Construction Site Safety Experience Modification Ratios (EMR) for 2014 and 2015, as requested.



SUMMARY OF COBRA/CYMI JV REFERENCES

- Eight (8) references were contacted and questioned about their professional experience with the bidder's organization. One (1) of the listed references could not be reached.
- Discussions with references did not confirm nor provide any additional evidence that COBRA/CYMI JV meets the requirements of a responsive bidder.

After a thorough evaluation of this SOE, taken in its entirety, it is LNV's opinion that COBRA/CYMI JV has not demonstrated that it meets the minimum experience and qualification requirements set forth in the contract documents and, as per Section 00 21 13 and Section 00 30 00, is considered a non-responsive bidder.

The following two tables summarize the evaluation of the CSA Construction, Inc. SOE.

CSA CONSTRUCTION, INC. SOE

ITEMS DEMONSTRATING EXPERIENCE

- Resumes for Project Manager, Superintendent, Safety Manager and Quality Control Manager (both primary and alternate for each position) demonstrate sufficient experience in similar public-sector water and wastewater projects.
- Four (4) of the five (5) listed projects qualify as projects of similar type and magnitude completed by the bidder's organization.
- In addition, CSA has completed approximately forty-three (43) similar, to marginally similar, water and wastewater treatment projects over the past 10 years.
- CSA listed four (4) wastewater projects previously completed with the City of Corpus Christi.
- CSA demonstrated better than average Construction Site Safety Experience Modification Ratios (EMR) for the last 3 years (2015, 2016, and 2017), as requested, and in 2013 and 2014 as well.

ITEMS NOT DEMONSTRATING EXPERIENCE

- One (1) of the five (5) listed projects has not yet been completed and is still under construction. This project cannot be used to demonstrate the Contractor's ability to successfully complete projects.
NOTE: However, CSA included a supplementary list of 43 other completed projects of similar experience in their SOE.



SUMMARY OF CSA CONSTRUCTION REFERENCES

- Six (6) references were contacted and questioned about their professional experience with the bidder's organization.
- All six (6) references provided positive feedback and confirmed that they would hire CSA Construction again.
- One (1) reference, associated with the incomplete project mentioned above, stated that the project is approximately 85% complete and ahead of schedule. He stated that CSA has exceeded their expectations and said that "CSA is the best in Texas when it comes to water and wastewater treatment contracting".
- Five (5) references confirmed their projects were on schedule and on budget.
- CSA Construction, Inc. website, www.csaconstruction.com, references and provides a list of over 100 water treatment and wastewater treatment plants they have completed in the State of Texas since 1979.

LVN/Jacobs determined that CSA Construction meets the minimum experience requirements specified Section 00 45 16 of contract documents and considers CSA a responsive bidder capable of completing the work required in this project. LVN/Jacobs recommends that the City of Corpus Christi award the contract for construction of the Oso WRP Headworks and Lift Station project to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder, CSA Construction, Inc., in the amount of \$22,865,540.00.

If you have any questions or need additional information, please contact me at (361) 883-1984.

Sincerely,

LVN, Inc.

TBPE No. F-366

 10/24/17

Logan Burton, P.E.

Vice-President/Project Manager

Enclosures:

1. Bid Tabulation (1 Page)

cc: Jiangang Deng, P.E.; Sylvia Arriaga

TABULATION OF BIDS

DEPARTMENT OF ENGINEERING SERVICES - CITY OF CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS

TABULATED BY: Kate Nartey-Quaye, PE
DATE: Wednesday, August 16, 2017

ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE: \$26,776,000.00
TIME OF COMPLETION: 790 Calendar Days

Oso Water Reclamation Plant Headworks and Lift Station	COBRA-CYMI JV 815 Walker Street Su-1140 Houston, Texas 77002	CSA Construction, Inc. 2314 McAllister Houston, Texas 77092	Kiewit Infrastructure South Co. 13119 Pld Denton Road Fort Worth, Texas 76177	Pepper Lawson Waterworks, LLC 1725 HugHes Landing Blvd, Suite 1200 The Woodlands, Texas 77380
CITY PROJECT NO. E12206				

Item	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	ESTIMATED QUANTITY	UNIT PRICE	AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	AMOUNT
PART A - WASTEWATER IMPROVEMENTS (per SECTION 01 29 01 MEASUREMENT AND BASIS FOR PAYMENT)											
A1	MOBILIZATION/DEMOBILIZATION, COMPLETE IN PLACE PER LUMP SUM.	LS	1	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,250,000.00	\$ 1,250,000.00
A2	THIS ITEM CONSISTS OF ALL SUPERVISION, EQUIPMENT, TOOLS, LABOR, AND MATERIALS TO PERFORM ALL DEMOLITION AND TEMPORARY WORK, SITE/CIVIL, STRUCTURAL, MECHANICAL, PLUMBING, ELECTRICAL AND INSTRUMENTATION/CONTROLS WORK, AS REQUIRED TO CONSTRUCT, COMPLETE AND MAKE OPERATIONAL THE OSO WRP REHABILITATION AND IMPROVEMENTS. THIS ITEM INCLUDES ALL WORK SPECIFIED AND/OR SHOWN ON THE CONTRACT DOCUMENTS, AND ALL OTHER ITEMS NECESSARY TO COMPLETE THE WORK THAT ARE NOT SPECIFICALLY INCLUDED IN OTHER BID ITEMS. PAYMENT OF THIS ITEM WILL BE MADE PER LUMP SUM, COMPLETE AND IN PLACE.	LS	1	\$ 17,375,000.00	\$ 17,375,000.00	\$ 18,981,510.00	\$ 18,981,510.00	\$ 20,324,390.00	\$ 20,324,390.00	\$ 21,407,690.00	\$ 21,407,690.00
A3	GRIT REMOVAL, WASHING AND DEWATERING EQUIPMENT SUPPLIER SCOPE AS DEFINED ON THE DRAWINGS AND IN SECTION 46 23 23 OF THE CONTRACT SPECIFICATIONS.	LS	1	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00	\$ 1,330,990.00
A4	FURNISH ALL LABOR, EQUIPMENT, MATERIALS, INCIDENTALS AND RELATED ITEMS REQUIRED FOR THE REMOVAL AND DISPOSAL AT THE CEFE VALENZUELA LANDFILL OF UP TO 250 TONS OF DEBRIS AND GRIT IN CLARIFIERS #1 - 8 INFLUENT CHANNELS AND TROUGHS, COMPLETE IN PLACE PER TON.	TONS	250	\$ 800.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 450.00	\$ 112,500.00	\$ 411.00	\$ 102,750.00	\$ 550.00	\$ 137,500.00
A5	FURNISH ALL LABOR, EQUIPMENT, MATERIALS, INCIDENTALS AND RELATED ITEMS REQUIRED FOR THE REHABILITATION OF EXISTING 580LF - 48" EQUALIZATION LINE AND 110LF - 36" GRAVITY LINE VIA CIPP (14' - 18' DEPTH). ITEM INCLUDES ALL SERVICES NECESSARY FOR BYPASS PUMPING, FLOW CONTROL, PLUGGING, CLEANING OF HOST PIPE PRIOR TO INSTALLATION OF CIPP LINER, PRE AND POST VIDEO INSPECTIONS OF PIPES, ALL PERFORMANCE TESTING REQUIREMENTS, AND QUALITY CONTROL MEASURES. PAYMENT WILL BE PER LUMP SUM, COMPLETE AND IN PLACE.	LS	1	\$ 600,000.00	\$ 600,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 290,000.00	\$ 290,000.00
A6	EXPLORATORY EXCAVATION, COMPLETE IN PLACE PER LUMP SUM.	LS	1	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 414,000.00	\$ 414,000.00	\$ 83,000.00	\$ 83,000.00
A7	UTILITY RELOCATION ALLOWANCE	LS	1	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00
SUBTOTAL PART A - WASTEWATER IMPROVEMENTS (Items A1 thru A7)					\$ 21,305,990.00		\$ 22,325,000.00		\$ 24,222,130.00		\$ 24,999,180.00

TOTAL PROJECT BASE BID (PART A)	\$ 21,305,990.00		\$ 22,325,000.00		\$ 24,222,130.00		\$ 24,999,180.00
---------------------------------	------------------	--	------------------	--	------------------	--	------------------

Part B - ADDITIVE ALTERNATIVE NO.1 (per SECTION 01 23 10 ALTERNATES AND ALLOWANCES)											
B1	FURNISH ALL LABOR, EQUIPMENT, MATERIALS, INCIDENTALS AND RELATED ITEMS REQUIRED FOR THE REMOVAL AND DISPOSAL AT THE CEFE VALENZUELA LANDFILL OF UP TO 1170 TONS OF DEBRIS AND GRIT IN WEST AND EAST TREATMENT TRAIN RETURN TROUGHS, COMPLETE IN PLACE PER TON.	TONS	1170	\$ 500.00	\$ 585,000.00	\$ 462.00	\$ 540,540.00	\$ 411.00	\$ 480,870.00	\$ 446.00	\$ 521,820.00
SUBTOTAL PART B - ADDITIVE ALTERNATE NO. 1 (PART B)					\$ 585,000.00		\$ 540,540.00		\$ 480,870.00		\$ 521,820.00