

November 19, 2018

Jeff Edmonds, P.E.
Director of Engineering Services
City of Corpus Christi
P.O. Box 9277
Corpus Christi, Texas 78469

Re: Wesley E. Seale Dam Outlet Rehabilitation
City Project No. E17010

Mr. Edmonds:

The City of Corpus Christi received four (4) sealed bid proposals for the above referenced project on October 31, 2018 at 2:00 p.m. in the Third Floor Smartboard Room. The project bid included a base bid for work to replace the downstream valves on the low-flow outlet at the dam, as well as an additive alternate for bypassing the municipal and industrial and other water supply required downstream of the structure during critical work activities as needed based on lake levels. Attached are the bid tabulations of the four (4) bid proposals.

All four bid proposals were properly executed and submitted in compliance with the bidding requirements for this project. We performed an analysis of the bids and found one discrepancy in ACP's bid for one category of items (C13-C17), however, the overall value is contained in a related item from the same manufacturer (C5), which is understandable, as the items are related and provided together. There does not seem to be a way that this discrepancy can be used against the City for changes, as the items are discrete (the valves) and therefore did not affect the outcome of the low bid result or put risk on the City for a future change order quantity. It may cause the early payout of value, as the higher priced items are likely to be available as a work item earlier in the project. No other errors or irregularities were noted on the proposal forms. The bid breakdown for the four bidders is shown on the attached Tabulation of Bids, and the Base Bids and Base Bid + Additive Alternate are summarized below:

<u>Bidder</u>	<u>Base Bid</u>		<u>Base Bid + Additive Alternate</u>	
Associated Construction Partners, Ltd.	\$1,507, 612.87	1	\$2,247,612.87	2
H&S Constructors	\$1, 516,800.00	2	\$2,363,800.00	3
Alltech Engineering, Corp.	\$1,663,000.00	3	\$2,196,000.00	1
ABBA	\$2,454,173.00	4	\$3,134,173.00	4

Based on Total Base Bid only, Associated Construction Partners, Ltd. is the apparent low bidder. Based on Total Base Bid + Additive Alternate, Alltech is the apparent low bidder. H&S previously performed Phase 1 of this project and was considered a top-notch contractor that understood the City's requirements and worked well with dam personnel on Phase 1. Mark Maroney has provided a similar assessment of ACP's record

November 12, 2018

Page 2 of 2

working on City lift stations and pump stations on his projects. Alltech is an excellent dam contractor that does major work around the country for the United States Bureau of Reclamation on their dams and has previously bid on large projects at Choke Canyon but came in second lowest. Any of the lowest three contractors are apparently excellent contractors and they all appear capable and amenable to the work, as well as having references for being professional and easy to work with.

The City bid the Additive Alternate for water supply bypass because at the time of preparation for the bid, the lake was too low to release water over the crest gates as required during elements of the construction. You may know that the lake has since filled, and spilled, and remains full. Because of that, it would be anticipated that the crest gates can be used to release water for the next 6 months or so, and that the bypassing would not be needed until midway through 2019. We also understand there is in-excess of 6 months' lead time required for the Howell-Bunger Valve, so the project is expected to take as much as a year. It is conceivable that prior to the end of the project, the City may require bypassing of water supply.

Based on the City's evaluation criteria for this project for the Base Bid, Associated Construction Partners, Ltd. out of San Antonio, Texas is the lowest qualified Bidder for the Base Bid only, and their Total Amount Bid for the Base Bid is within the City's construction budget.

Based on the City's evaluation criteria for this project for the Base Bid + Additive Alternate, Alltech Engineering, Corp. out of Mendota Heights, Minnesota is the lowest qualified Bidder for the Base Bid + Additive Alternate, and the Total Amount Bid for the Base Bid + Additive Alternate is within the City's construction budget.

Therefore, FNI recommends that the City award the construction contract for Wesley E. Seale Dam Outlet Rehabilitation (City Project No. E17010) in the following manner:

For Base Bid Only:

Award to Associated Construction Partners, Ltd. out of San Antonio

If the City awards the base only, this would be the **lowest price base bid**. If the City awards the base bid initially, they would not then be able to award the alternate later.

For Base Bid + Additive Alternate:

Award to Alltech Engineering, Corp. out of Mendota Heights, Minnesota

This would represent the **lowest combined bid**

Due to the current abundance of water supply and the predicted wet winter, as well as the available water for routing from Choke Canyon, a decision to award the base bid only at this time to Associated Construction Partners, Ltd. seems warranted. If bypass pumping/siphoning is needed later in the project, it will have to be procured by other means.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, please feel free to contact us.

Sincerely,

FRESE AND NICHOLS, INC.



Brian Bresler, P.E.

Attachments: Tabulation of Bids